

**BAKER BOTTS** LLP

910 LOUISIANA  
HOUSTON, TEXAS  
77002-4995

TEL +1 713.229.1234  
FAX +1 713.229.1522  
BakerBotts.com

AUSTIN  
BRUSSELS  
DALLAS  
DUBAI

**HOUSTON**  
LONDON

NEW YORK  
PALO ALTO  
RIYADH  
SAN FRANCISCO  
SINGAPORE  
WASHINGTON

March 1, 2023

**Via ECF**

Hon. Andrew M. Edison  
United States Magistrate Judge  
United States District Court  
Southern District of Texas  
601 Rosenberg, Seventh Floor  
Galveston, Texas 77550

Amy Pharr Hefley  
TEL +1 713.229.1270  
FAX +1 713.229.2770  
amy.hefley@bakerbotts.com

Re: No. 4:21-cv-00575, *In re Plymouth County Retirement Sys. v. Apache Corp., et al.*

Dear Judge Edison,

Pursuant to the Court's Docket Control Order, Dkt. 86, the Plymouth County Retirement System ("Plymouth County") and the Trustees of the Teamsters Union No. 142 Pension Fund ("Teamsters 142") (collectively, "Lead Plaintiffs") and Defendants Apache Corporation ("Apache"), John J. Christmann, IV, Timothy J. Sullivan, and Stephen J. Riney (collectively, "Defendants" and, together with Lead Plaintiffs, the "Parties") provide the Court with this update concerning the status of their efforts to agree to a search protocol pertaining to Defendants' document production in this matter.<sup>1</sup>

Lead Plaintiffs served their First Set of Requests for Production on Defendants ("Requests") on December 29, 2022, and Defendants served their Objections and Responses to Lead Plaintiffs' Requests on January 30, 2023. Since December 2022, the Parties have engaged in good-faith negotiations on discovery matters in this action, including a proposed Discovery Confidentiality Agreement and Protective Order ("Protective Order"), which the Parties submit separately today for the Court's approval. The Parties have also engaged in extensive discussions pertaining to the Search Protocol for Plaintiff's Requests, and have agreed on individual document custodians whose documents Defendants will search in response to the Requests and produce as part of their rolling production.

The Parties are continuing to negotiate other components of the Search Protocol, including (i) the search terms that will be applied to emails and, where appropriate, non-custodial sources; and (ii) the custodial and non-custodial data sources that are available and that Defendants will search. The Parties are hopeful that continued negotiations on these remaining items will eliminate or limit any disputes. The Parties, therefore, respectfully request that they be permitted to continue such discussions until March 21, 2023, at which point they will report their

---

<sup>1</sup> The Docket Control Order requires, among other things, that within thirty (30) days of Defendants' responses and objections to Plaintiff's Requests, the Parties must agree to a search protocol ("the "Search Protocol") or present to the Court any disputed issues pertaining to the Search Protocol.

**BAKER BOTTS<sub>LLP</sub>**

Hon. Andrew M. Edison

- 2 -

March 1, 2023

agreement to the Court or present to the Court for resolution any Search Protocol matters on which they disagree.<sup>2</sup>

/s/ Josh D'Ancona

**KESSLER TOPAZ**

**MELTZER & CHECK, LLP**

Gregory M. Castaldo (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Johnston de F. Whitman, Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Joshua E. D'Ancona (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Michelle M. Newcomer (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Richard A. Russo Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Daniel B. Rotko (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Austin W. Manning (admitted *pro hac vice*)

280 King of Prussia Road

Radnor, PA 19087

Telephone: (610) 667-7706

Facsimile: (610) 667-7056

gcastaldo@ktmc.com

jwhitman@ktmc.com

jdancana@ktmc.com

mnewcomer@ktmc.com

rrusso@ktmc.com

drotko@ktmc.com

amanning@ktmc.com

/s/ Amy Pharr Hefley

**BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.**

David D. Sterling

Attorney-In-Charge

Texas Bar No. 19170000

Federal I.D. No. 07079

Amy Pharr Hefley

State Bar No. 24046046

910 Louisiana Street

Houston, TX 77002

Telephone: (713) 229-1946

Facsimile: (713) 229-7946

david.sterling@bakerbotts.com

amy.hefley@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel Attorneys for Defendants Apache Corporation, John J. Christmann IV, Timothy J. Sullivan, and Stephen J. Riney*

**SAXENA WHITE P.A.**

David R. Kaplan (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Wolfram T. Worms (admitted *pro hac vice*)

Hani Farah (admitted *pro hac vice*)

505 Lomas Santa Fe Dr., Suite 180

Solana Beach, CA 92075

Telephone: (858) 997-0860

Facsimile: (858) 369-0096

dkaplan@saxenawhite.com

wworms@saxenawhite.com

hfarah@saxenawhite.com

-and-

<sup>2</sup> Relatedly, the Parties are also negotiating a Discovery Protocol Regarding Electronically Stored Information and Paper Documents in an attempt to have an agreed-upon framework for certain aspects of the parties' collection, search, and production methodologies.

**BAKER BOTTS<sub>LLP</sub>**

Hon. Andrew M. Edison

- 3 -

March 1, 2023

Steven B. Singer (pro hac vice forthcoming)  
Joshua H. Saltzman (admitted pro hac vice)  
10 Bank Street, 8th Floor  
White Plains, NY 10606  
Telephone: (914) 437-8551  
Facsimile: (888) 631-3611  
ssinger@saxenawhite.com  
jsaltzman@saxenawhite.com

-and-

Maya Saxena (pro hac vice forthcoming)  
Joseph E. White, III (pro hac vice  
forthcoming)  
Lester R. Hooker (pro hac vice forthcoming)  
7777 Glades Road, Suite 300  
Boca Raton, FL 33434  
Telephone: (561) 394-3399  
Facsimile: (561) 394-3382  
msaxena@saxenawhite.com  
jwhite@saxenawhite.com  
lhooker@saxenawhite.com

*Co- Lead Counsel for Lead Plaintiffs*

**AJAMIE LLP**

Thomas R. Ajamie, Attorney-in-Charge  
Texas Bar No. 00952400  
S.D. Tex. No. 6165  
John S. “Jack” Edwards, Jr.  
Texas Bar No. 24040851  
S.D. Tex. No. 38095  
Pennzoil Place – South Tower  
711 Louisiana, Suite 2150  
Houston, TX 77002  
Telephone: (713) 860-1600  
Facsimile: (713) 860-1699  
tajamie@ajamie.com  
jedwards@ajamie.com

*Liaison Counsel for Lead Plaintiffs*